

Meeting Minutes
Virtual Session
February 13, 2019
National Science Foundation
Arlington, VA 22314

MEETING PARTICIPANTS

CEOSE Members Present

Dr. Jose D. Fuentes, CEOSE Chair, Pennsylvania State University, Philadelphia, PA
Dr. Alicia Knoedler, CEOSE Vice Chair, Independent Research Leadership and Development Consultant
Dr. Gilda Barabino, CCUNY
Dr. Suzanne, Barbour, University of Georgia
Dr. Juan Gilbert, Clemson University
Dr. Kaye Husbands-Fealing, Georgia Institute of Technology
Dr. Nai-Chang Yeh, California Institute of Technology
Dr. Daniela Marghitu, Auburn University
Dr. Robert Eugene Megginson, University of Michigan
Dr. Peter Eden, Landmark College
Dr. Lydia Villa-Komaroff, Intersections SBD

CEOSE Members Absent

Dr. Charles Isbell, Georgia Institute of Technology, GA

CEOSE Designated Federal Officer – Executive Liaison

Dr. Suzanne Iacono, Office Head, OIA/OD/NSF

CEOSE Executive Secretary

Dr. Bernice Anderson, Senior Advisor, OIA/OD/NSF

CEOSE Scientific/Technical/Administrative Staff

Ms. Jolaina Jeff-Cartier, Staff Associate, OIA/OD/NSF

Ms. Una Alford, Program Analyst, OIA/OD/NSF

Mr. Steve Buhneing, Communication Specialist, OIA/OD/NSF

Welcome, Introductions & Opening Remarks

Dr. Jose D. Fuentes, CEOSE Chair, opened the meeting and welcomed the members with an appreciation for their flexibility regarding a virtual meeting, in lieu of an in-person meeting. Members and NSF Staff introduced themselves. Dr. Fuentes conveyed the membership's concern about the recent government shutdown, as well as gratitude for the work of the Foundation. He also provided an overview of the meeting, pointing out that the primary goal is to complete the 2017-2018 Biennial Report to Congress.

Due to technical issues, the Committee was not able to receive the report from the NSF Executive Liaison.

Working Session: Independent Review of the 2017-2018 CEOSE Biennial Report to Congress

Dr. Alicia Knoedler, CEOSE Vice Chair, recapped the working session and decisions of the October 2018 meeting regarding the CEOSE report. The committee was separated into groups to review each section of the Biennial Report and the following members accepted work assignments for the following sections of the upcoming report: **Section I:** Kaye Husbands Fealing and Peter Eden; **Section II:** Gilda Barabino, Daniella Marghitu, and Jose D. Fuentes; **Section III:** Lydia Villa-Komaroff, Juan Gilbert, and Nai-Chang Yeh; and **Section IV:** Alicia Knoedler. Members worked off-line to review the report.

Discussion: Reports of CEOSE Liaisons to NSF Advisory Committees

The CEOSE Liaisons provided meeting overviews for the following advisory committees: B&O (Alicia); ENG (Gilda), OPP (Jose), SBE (Lydia), EHR (Kaye). Broadening participation comments included the following:

- Request for a CEOSE update at the spring meeting of B&O,
- ENG's increased involvement with NSF INCLUDES and collaboration efforts with Computing Sciences,
- OPP's emphasis on community engagement, especially for Native communities, and
- A need to keep CEOSE presentation current.

Discussion: Investing in Diverse Community Voices, An Innovative Strategy for Advancing Knowledge and Broadening Participation

The Committee members agreed that the report conveys the message that diversity empowers innovation and that the need to give attention to diversity in STEM is supported by data. The Vice-Chair recapped that the report aims to provide Congress with the status of broadening participation both within NSF and across the broader context of the scientific enterprise. The report content covers NSF broadening participation programs and awards, progress on the implementation of NSF INCLUDES as a Big Idea, discussions at CEOSE meetings and topics for the future. CEOSE will be seeking community engagement examples from NSF Directorates to be included in report. The goal is to have the body of the report fully drafted by March 5, 2019. Dissemination of the report beyond NSF and Congress will be discussed at the June 2019 meeting.

The members provided specific feedback for improving/enhancing each section. Some of their comments are noted below:

- Section I: Introduction and the National Landscape for Broadening Participation
 - Include neurodiversity,
 - Add a paragraph that capsulizes inclusive research methods and shows connectivity across CEOSE reports,
 - Include K-12 data/information, if available,
 - Include a discovery research example and/or examples to address the 2017-2018 recommendation.
- Section II: Increasing Accessibility, Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion in STEM—NSF's Efforts
 - Convert tables to graphs or pie charts,
 - Include reviewer/PI data tables for disabled and other underrepresented groups,
 - Re-order the discussion of the NSF broadening participation efforts to lead with NSF INCLUDES, and

- Cut content to reduce redundancy.
- Section III: Advancing Broadening Participation: CEOSE Activities 2017-2018
 - Strengthen the discussion on sexual harassment, and
 - Include a statement that CEOSE received presentations on seven (7) of the 10 Big Ideas and will have presentations on the other three at upcoming CEOSE meetings.
- Section IV: CEOSE Recommendation and Plans for the Future
 - Include additional literature to make clear what is meant by implementation research or co-production of knowledge,
 - Provide some examples to help inform the primary recommendation for the report (examples may be found in GEO GOLD portfolio, EPSCoR's Track III awards that focused on broadening participation, and the NSF INCLUDES portfolio)
 - Develop a doable listing of plans for the future such that there is strategy for implementing accountability measures, e.g. showcase what is working in thematic areas

The Committee also revised the themes for the next five meetings. Future areas of interest include:

1. Inclusion and intersectionality,
2. Effective policy development and implementation regarding STEM employment of persons with disabilities, and
3. Robust engagement of MSIs in ground-breaking research.

A future meeting will include a discussion on how to measure milestones and successes related to the 2017-2018 recommendation.

Announcements and Final Remarks

Revisions to the various sections of the CEOSE report are due to the Vice Chair between February 20-22, 2019.

March 15, 2019 is the suggested target date for submission of the internal review version of the 2017-2018 CEOSE report to NSF for fact checking.

The Chair and Vice Chair will work with NSF staff on the report cover, executive summary and appendices. CEOSE will still place the request to every directorate for community engagement in research exemplars.

The next meeting will be held in June 2019 and potential topics for presentations at future meetings include:

1. Continued focus on accountability for broadening participation,
2. The science of effective mentoring, and
3. IHE leaders' contributions to campus/STEM diversity, including leaders of Centers and issues of race and inclusion.

The Chair requested a set of slides to summarize the report details and the Vice-Chair agreed to update the CEOSE slideshow. OIA staff will work with CEOSE on the report production and dissemination, including a Dear Colleague letter and brochure as well as content for the slideshow.

The Chair thanked everyone for their time and attendance and adjourned the meeting.